

APPROVED MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES OF THE COMMUNITY COLLEGE  
DISTRICT OF THE COUNTY OF MACOMB

A regular meeting of the Board of Trustees of the Community College District of the County of Macomb was held Wednesday, October 21, 2020 at 6:00 p.m., electronically through GoToMeeting in order to maintain safe distancing practices and to avoid the occurrence of a large gathering.

1.0 [CALL TO ORDER](#)

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Lorenzo at 6:04 p.m.

2.0 [ROLL CALL](#)

Present:

Katherine Lorenzo, Clinton Township, Chairperson  
Frank Cusumano, Macomb Township, Vice Chairperson  
Kristi Dean, Shelby Township, Secretary  
Roseanne DiMaria, Eastpointe, Treasurer  
Joan Flynn, Warren, Trustee  
Shelley Vitale, Macomb Township, Trustee  
Vincent Viviano, Shelby Township, Trustee

Absent:

None

Also present:

James Sawyer, President  
Sharon Kowal, Assistant to the President  
Jeffrey Steele, General Counsel (Due to an audio issue, General Counsel is not visible on screen but continues to participate in the meeting)

3.0 [APPROVAL OF AGENDA](#)

MOTION by DiMaria, supported by Flynn, to approve the agenda as presented.

ROLL CALL VOTE:

AYES: DiMaria, Flynn, Cusumano, Dean, Vitale, Viviano, Lorenzo

NAYS:

MOTION CARRIED.

4.0 APPROVAL OF MINUTES

4.1 Regular Meeting, September 16, 2020

MOTION BY Flynn, supported by Viviano, to approve the minutes of the September 16, 2020 regular meeting, as read.

ROLL CALL VOTE:

AYES: Flynn, Viviano, Cusumano, Dean, DiMaria, Vitale, Lorenzo

NAYS:

MOTION CARRIED.

5.0 BOARD OF TRUSTEES REPORTS/PROPOSALS

5.1 Board of Trustees Reports (verbal)

Chair Lorenzo invited everyone to wish Dr. Sawyer a happy birthday.

5.2 Alterations to 2020 Calendar of Meetings

MOTION by Cusumano, supported by DiMaria, that the Board of Trustees acknowledge the changes to the 2020 Calendar of Meetings; the cancellation of the October 21, 2020 information session; the change in the time and location of the October 21, 2020 regular meeting to 6:00 p.m. and held electronically.

ROLL CALL VOTE:

AYES: Cusumano, DiMaria, Viviano, Dean, Flynn, Vitale, Lorenzo

NAYS:

MOTION CARRIED.

6.0 PRESIDENT'S REPORT (verbal)

Dr. Sawyer's remarks:

Public Meetings: Governor Whitmer signed Public Act 228 of 2020 which allows virtual meetings of public bodies through the end of the year. The Act is retroactive to March 18, 2020. In January 2021 there are no accommodations for virtual meetings except for members of the military, unless there is a declared state of emergency. We will continue to monitor the situation and finish preparing our facilities to host meetings on ground and still abide by the social distancing guidelines. Dr. Sawyer has consulted with Chair Lorenzo and she agrees we will hold the November board meeting virtually.

State Budget: Dr. Sawyer said we have received confirmation that the state budget was held at the FY19/20 level. This is encouraging because we had anticipated an 11 percent reduction. The restored budget information will be reflected in the revised budget presented to the board in December.

Budget Reductions: Dr. Sawyer said the college continues to work on budget reductions. To the staff's credit they have identified several potential budget reductions that will be incorporated into the revised budget. He has shared before, that the primary means of savings has been

through staff layoffs and unfilled positions. Some staff have been recalled to fill critical positions and we look forward to when we can recall our remaining staff and resume normal operations.

Enrollment: Dr. Sawyer said enrollment continues to be down 14 percent over last fall. In the state, enrollment at community colleges has declined an average of 11 percent. All colleges have taken a big hit. There has been a lot written over the past few months in *The Chronicle of Higher Education* and *Inside Higher Ed* about enrollment declines indicating it is a national phenomenon. We remain convinced that Covid has played a big role in the decline.

Dr. Sawyer said the college sent a survey to those who attended classes during the 2020 winter term but did not persist this fall, inquiring as to why they did not return. Approximately 1,000 students responded. The primary reason (34%) was they don't like online classes because they feel they aren't learning as much. The second reason (24%) was the fear of Covid. As we had anticipated that had a big impact on enrollment.

Items that have been addressed for winter semester:

- Bookstore will have physical presence at both center (P building) and south campus (Sports & Expo).
- Bookstores will open when priority registration starts on November 2.
- Financial Aid will be available earlier to students with the hope they will purchase their books sooner.
- Incentives of free shipping and a 10 percent discount for books purchased before December 18.
- Continuing to work with Follett to ensure they reach required staffing levels. We have engaged some federal work study students to help fill the void.
- All adjunct counselors and academic advisors have been recalled to better position us to help students in a timely manner.
- In recognition of the support received from about 90 Macomb staff members during the last few weeks of August when we fell behind, Follett has donated a \$30,000 scholarship for students to the MCC Foundation.
- A ChatBot will be implemented on My Macomb for Counseling and Advising to help answer some of the general questions students may have, eliminating their need to send an email or wait in the phone queue.
- Virtual tours will be enhanced and used by the admissions staff to provide students with a better sense of what Macomb is all about.
- There has been some consideration given to making videos to show online learning in action and dispel some of the myths that it is not a way to engage with students.
- The intake process has been modified to combine Starting at Macomb and Course Planning sessions for a more streamline process and using the time spent with students more efficiently.
- We are hopeful these changes will help our students be better served as they move forward into the winter term.

Futures for Frontliners: Dr. Sawyer said the governor launched this program on September 10. It is designed for essential workers who worked during the first 13 weeks of the pandemic and do not have a degree. Macomb has 732 students who are qualified and have received notice they are eligible for federal financial aid. There are another 330 students that qualify but the college needs additional documentation from them in order to assess their qualifications for federal financial aid. This is a pool of potential students that we hadn't counted on and we are here to help them create an educational journey that they didn't think would be possible.

Audit: Dr. Sawyer said the audit is usually presented to the board in October. As you recall, the board approved a one-time exception for the audit to be presented by the end of the year. The exception was put in place because of the CARES Act and the interpretations of it that continue to change.

Cleaning Contract: Dr. Sawyer said last year we extended the cleaning contract for an additional year with the commitment to revisit it this year. After reflecting on that, the leadership team decided that this is not the time to rebid the cleaning contract. Throughout the pandemic we have worked closely with ABM. We are satisfied with their service and their handling of the additional cleanings that are now required. The process of thoroughly vetting a new cleaning company would take several months and under the current cleaning requirements we see it as an unnecessary risk. Our recommendation is to extend ABM's cleaning contract for one year with the intent of revisiting the contract in 2022 when we have hopefully resumed normal operations.

Information Items: Dr. Sawyer said we have five information items before the board tonight. Two are IT purchases using CARES Act funding. Currently there are a number of items going through the purchasing process that will be funded with CARES money and we simply won't have time to come to the board for approval. Therefore, we will be exercising the option in our purchasing policy that permits the vice president of business and the president to approve the purchases. Rest assured that we are following the purchasing process to identify those vendors, but they will be presented to the board as information items. For tonight's meeting, Dr. Sawyer suggested the board consider combining the information items into a single motion. He said under the advice of counsel, Chairperson Lorenzo would read each item and ask for one motion. Representatives are here to answer any questions that trustees may have.

Student CARES Act Funding: Dr. Sawyer said of the \$4.8 million available, \$4.5 million has been distributed to over 3,400 students. We will continue to provide money to students who come forth with emergency needs, but our intent is to have the balance of the CARES Act funding available through the winter start-up for students in need of technology support.

Institutional CARES Act Funding: Dr. Sawyer said of the \$4.8 million for the institution, we have recovered \$1.1 million for interrupted operations during FY 19/20. The remaining \$3.7 million is intended to cover interrupted operations and equipment purchases that we have needed during this fiscal year. We are comfortable that we will be able to use all the money within the guidelines.

State CARES Act Funding: Dr. Sawyer said the college received an allocation of \$3.8 million through the State CARES funding which was intended to be a replacement for the budget cut from last year. At this time, \$1.2 million has been spent or is in the process of being spent. These funds are for additional technology items we are going to purchase to support our educational programs. Per the funding guidelines this money must be spent before December 30.

County CARES Act Funding: Dr. Sawyer said we recently received authorization for \$1.3 million to spend on technology that we will be able to spend with no concerns, and another \$1 million for education and safety equipment. We are running courses in the engineering advanced technology area, and in business and information technology. The courses need to be complete by mid-December and we do not believe we will be able to run enough courses to spend down all the funding. These funds are available to companies that want to send their employees to us for training in high tech areas at no cost to the employer.

Strategic Planning 2025: Dr. Sawyer said because of the pandemic there was a pause in the strategic planning process, but we have reengaged and started addressing our strategic priorities. The most beneficial aspect of the process was the broad engagement with staff from across the college in different areas and positions and we want to continue that involvement. The way we are going to do that is through the creation of institutional councils. These councils will be aligned with each of the strategic priorities. Each council will be led by a vice president and members will be staff from all different positions and areas of the college. That will give us a broad voice as we focus on our strategic priorities. The councils will also be an opportunity for us to make sure we are integrating the work, that we are working logistically and breaking down some silos. The councils will be communicating amongst themselves to make sure we are working together as opposed to having conflicting or similar projects.

Diversity, Equity and Inclusion: Dr. Sawyer said the creation of the institutional IDEA council (Inclusion, Diversity, Equity, Access) is to help identify and eliminate any systemic barriers within the college that would serve to oppose an inclusive and equitable environment for all students and employees. This council would serve as our convening group for those types of issues. There are a number of different initiatives going on around the college and they will be centralized, from an awareness perspective, under the IDEA council. The council will provide input, offer support and monitor progress to make sure we stay on track and actually make significant differences as we address inclusion, equity and diversity at the college. Currently 28 staff members are participating in a program called the Equity NOW! Series put on by the University of Southern California. This was a workshop we were made aware of through Achieving the Dream. The workshop is focusing specifically on equity with an emphasis around race. It has been a great informational program for us. It is certainly growing the knowledge of those participating and it will help provide a foundation for the work of the IDEA council as well. He will periodically update the board on our initiatives in the diversity, equity and inclusion area.

Bachelor of Science in Nursing: Dr. Sawyer said there hasn't been any activity in the senate to approve this bill. However, this is the type of thing that can turn on a moment's notice. He has communicated with all three of our senators and they are supportive of the program. Trustee Cusumano also shared a letter with his senator, Michael MacDonald. We have done all we can to

help support the legislation and now we wait to see the outcome. The MCCA has speculated that if it is not approved it will go into the lame duck session. We will see after the election if that is in fact the case, but he will keep the board apprised.

Tuition Refund Policy: Dr. Sawyer said we are working on the yearlong registration process to launch next year, but some changes to the Tuition Refund Policy need to be made in order to address timeline and date issues. The policy will be brought to the board in November for a first reading. There are no major changes.

Annual Tuition Review: Dr. Sawyer said based on the yearlong registration process, the timeline for our annual tuition review must happen earlier. We will present our thoughts on tuition at the January meeting for discussion, prior to asking the trustees to support our recommendation in February as opposed to March.

Marketing Update: Dr. Sawyer said during last month's discussion on the Strategic Values template, Trustee's Flynn and Vitale indicated their interest in the different initiatives and areas of the college and the work that they do. In response to that, Dr. Sawyer said, we will begin providing updates to the board. Recently, our marketing area was receiving a lot of attention, in particular what were we doing to address our enrollment decline and how do we measure success in that area. Tonight, Vice President Kevin Chandler and Marketing Director Audrey Takacs will give an update on marketing. Looking ahead to November, Dr. Sawyer said the update will be given by General Council Jeff Steele and Vice President Jill Thomas-Little on the student code of conduct. Mr. Steele will also present the work he has been doing on the civil rights suite of policies for a first reading in December.

Marketing Presentation by K. Chandler and A. Takacs

Questions for Dr. Sawyer:

- Trustee Cusumano asked Dr. Sawyer if the decline of 14 percent is in credit hours? Dr. Sawyer responded, yes.
- Trustee Cusumano asked Dr. Sawyer what segment of our student population is encompassed in the governor's Futures for Frontliners? Dr. Sawyer said the program is for anyone who worked in an essential frontline job between April 1 through June 30. For example, grocery store clerks, gas station attendants, nurse's aides. The key being, they don't have a degree yet. They can have a certificate, just not a degree.
- Trustee Cusumano asked if there has been an adjustment with the cleaning contract, given the fact that there has been a shutdown and there aren't people working in certain offices/buildings, etc., is that taken into account? As he understands the contract, it is not on a per job basis but an annual contract for cleaning the entire college infrastructure. Vice President Argiri responded to the question saying, we receive a credit when we shutter a building for a renovation. We are not receiving credits for the reduction of classes we are holding on campus because of Covid-19. We have about 300 students on campus per day and ABM is performing extra cleaning measures in those classrooms. In addition, we have repurposed some of their time to do additional cleaning that is not in the contract, for example, window cleaning, additional floor washing, and more extensive cleaning than they are able to do when we are fully on ground. We repurposed some of their work in order to

capture our monthly expenditure. They are critical to the ongoing safety and health of our students, faculty and staff and the cleaning they are doing is more intensive. Trustee Cusumano asked how much is the annual contract for ABM? Ms. Argiri said the annual contract is \$1.6 million. Ms. Argiri continued, saying that as President Sawyer mentioned, due to the ongoing pandemic we felt that it was not very prudent for the college to transition to a new cleaning contract provider at this time. Not only is there a lot of time involved in the bidding process but the greater concern, if we were to change providers, knowing it takes about 3 or 4 months to transition, the sacrifice that might be made is, of course, the extent and high expectations for the cleaning standards during that transition. While we intended to bid it out, we felt it was in the best interest of the college, our faculty, students and staff to continue with ABM for one year. We have been satisfied with the contract as you know. We bid it out previously and the bid amount was well within the range of the bids that we received. This is a contract that we rarely ever select low bid because low bid is based on hours and pay rate and results in the quality of the cleaning that the college would receive. Trustee Cusumano suggested perhaps working "Act of God" and/or epidemic clauses into these service contracts. He doesn't know what their manpower hours are, but if it's \$133,333 a month, intuitively it suggests that if 50 percent of the college is closed that perhaps they have reduced their staffing by 50 percent and that would act as a windfall to the contractor. He will leave it to her discretion. Ms. Argiri responded that we do monitor their staffing levels and they did not make any reductions. Trustee Cusumano said that is good to know.

Questions on the marketing presentation:

- Trustee Cusumano asked when we are looking at exposure to persons who are indicating that they intend to enroll in community college, where does that data set come from, is it from clicks online? Ms. Takacs said that she was marketed to by a list broker who sent her a flyer that said we have intender data. Intender data is very hard to find in higher ed. This broker, located in California, creates algorithms and they model the group of people. They compile their data by surveying people. If these people raise their hand and say "yes" they intend to enroll in community college, then this company applies a propensity score to their list. Based on how they answered the questions, the broker can say "Audrey" has a high propensity that her intentions to enroll at a community college are very valid and she is going to take next steps. We purchased this list of about 100,000 names and now we are testing to see how well it performs in the marketplace.
- Trustee Cusumano asked Ms. Takacs how does the expenditure of advertising dollars translate into students enrolled? Do we have any way of measuring that? Ms. Takacs said the best way to answer this question is the journey from an ad click. When people engage with us, we measure their engagement, the clicking on the call to action and the best we can do to measure is what happens after they click on that action. A journey from an ad click to the application is not always linear. Prospects are at various stages of the decision-making process. They may click on an ad, but they may not be ready to apply. Our goal in marketing is to generate interest that takes them to the next step in their journey to becoming a student. Which may be to learn more, take a tour, contact the college. Our role is to generate qualified leads for our admissions staff. Because of this, we create specific landing pages for ad traffic. When someone clicks an ad, they go to a landing page and that page provides more

- information. In the presentation she showed examples of our ads, they are really tiny and have just enough on them to get someone's interest to take the next step. From the landing page they can click "Apply" and that takes them to our website, the specific page that provides application choices. Once they click on one of those choices they enter into another system and into the admissions funnel. We have analytics from FY 19/20 indicating that there were 12,000 people who clicked on apply and ended up on the "choose the application for me" web page. We are tracking pretty high for this fiscal year as well. But once they go into the admissions funnel it is handed off and that area is trying to get that person to fill out the application and go through the funnel and become a student at Macomb.
- Trustee Vitale asked Ms. Takacs how her team addresses unplanned marketing opportunities that come up throughout the year? Ms. Takacs said for paid media we have to plan very upfront because we have to make all the media buys. If something comes up and an area says we need to have advertising dollars to do this, she will work with Dr. Chandler and others to figure out if there is a budget within the college to help us use those unexpended dollars on the advertising campaign. Oftentimes, when we get requests for awareness campaigns, we have what we call owned media. There are a lot of tactics that we own that we can promote on our own, like our social media accounts, things on the website, we try to use those live tactics when we can as well.
  - Trustee Vitale asked Ms. Takas what she meant when she mentioned the \$1.28 action cost, what does that exactly mean; does it cost us more for ads clicked on? Ms. Takacs said that was calculated based on fall, if you look at the dollars that we had allocated for the campaign and then you look at the number of clicks, 158,000, it was just a math calculation to say if you look at what we spent for the campaign and how many clicks it generated. Using this analysis, the average cost per click was \$1.28.
  - Chair Lorenzo asked Ms. Takacs when you have someone who is in your system, if they drop out at some point, do you have any data or anybody looking at their pain points or why they dropped out? For example, they couldn't read the fine print or didn't like the color of the ad, any of those subjective things that would tell you why someone is not moving forward in the process? Ms. Takacs said not unless we capture their name and address, which is difficult because as everything is based on an IP address and going to the website. So, unless they filled something out giving their name, that would be difficult. One of the things we have learned is that the journey is not linear, they might see an ad, come back in six months, go to our website and do something different. They don't necessarily go back to that landing page or to the app they originally saw. From the perspective we are working at the top of the funnel, if you will, we are not capturing that type of information or data.

Dr. Sawyer finished his comments stating there is one purchase item tonight for the dental lab. We did a great deal of work prior to making the board aware of this opportunity and are happy to get to the next step in this very exciting project. Hats off to the team for their hard work.



7.0 FINANCIAL REPORTS

7.1 Financial Statements – September 30, 2020

MOTION by DiMaria, supported by Cusumano, to receive and file the financial statements for the three months ended September 30, 2020.

ROLL CALL VOTE:

AYES: DiMaria, Cusumano, Dean, Flynn, Vitale, Viviano, Lorenzo

NAYS:

MOTION CARRIED.

7.2 Investment Report – September 30, 2020

MOTION by DiMaria, supported by Viviano, to receive and file the investment report of securities held as of September 30, 2020.

DISCUSSION: Trustee Cusumano thanked the Administration for the explanation of the inconsistencies in interest rates and he appreciates the conscientious treatment of the issue that was raised at the last meeting.

ROLL CALL VOTE:

AYES: DiMaria, Viviano, Dean, Flynn, Vitale, Viviano, Lorenzo

NAYS: Cusumano

MOTION CARRIED.

8.0 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (verbal)

None.

9.0 PERSONNEL REPORTS (none)

10.0 REPORTS OF ADMINISTRATION – INFORMATION ITEMS

10.1 2019-2020 Grant Closeout Report to the Board of Trustees

10.2 Update on the Investment Report

10.3 IT Purchases – CARES Act Funding Ivanti Application Control

10.4 IT Purchases – CARES Act Funding Ellucian Recruit Technical and Operational Services

10.5 Update on Media Buying and Placement Services

MOTION by Flynn, supported by Cusumano, to receive and file the information report.

DISCUSSION: Trustee Flynn asked how the students find out about these grants? Dr. Sawyer said it really depends on the grant, many of them have to go out and find a certain type of student. These are the type of grants that just aren't available to students, those are scholarships. The scholarships are for individual students and we make students

aware of those through our OASIS system, our financial aid office and the counseling and advising office. These grants are typically funding for project-type programming for a specifically targeted group of students. Trustee Flynn asked if the grant funding to the MCPA is for the Macomers? Dr. Sawyer said no, the Macomers are funded through the college.

ROLL CALL VOTE:

AYES: Flynn, Cusumano, Dean, DiMaria, Vitale, Viviano, Lorenzo

NAYS:

MOTION CARRIED.

## 11.0 REPORTS OF ADMINISTRATION – ACTION ITEMS

### 11.1 Donations – September 30, 2020

MOTION by Viviano, supported by DiMaria, to accept the donations as presented and acknowledged by the Administration.

ROLL CALL VOTE:

AYES: Viviano, DiMaria, Dean, Flynn, Vitale, Lorenzo

NAYS: Cusumano

MOTION CARRIED.

### 11.2 Change Orders (None)

### 11.3 Authorization for Purchases (None)

### 11.4 South Campus Dental Hygiene Clinical Classroom & Lab Building

MOTION by DiMaria, supported by Flynn, that the Board of Trustees approve the proposed budget for the renovation of South Campus N Building and the bids as presented, and authorize the award of contracts subject to the review and approval of General Counsel.

DISCUSSION: Trustee Dean asked, based on the pandemic, when is it anticipated the dental program will be ready to go? Dr. Sawyer said at this point we are still targeting our start up in fall 2020. In the meantime, we will still be onboarding people to help develop the program, but depending on the environment of the pandemic, we potentially may have to push back that date.

Trustee Flynn said she received a letter that says the Baker College dental clinic will expire in May 2022. Are they still seeing patients? Dr. Sawyer said they are still seeing patients, but they are shutting down their program locally. He said when a reputable institution closes a program, they take students in up to a certain point and are obligated to see those students through to the end of their program. The last cohort Baker College accepted will be done by that date.

Trustee Flynn asked why can't there be one construction bid? Do you have to get bids from everyone, the architect, the carpeting, the tiling? Dr. Sawyer said yes, we buy each of the components, because we think we get the best deal for the college that way. Trustee Flynn noted that it is a lot of bidding. Dr. Sawyer said it is a very complicated and complex process, but our staff does a great job with it. Trustee Viviano said we act as the general contractor, right? Dr. Sawyer said we have a relationship with Barton Malow who serves that purpose as well, but our folks are intimately involved with them. Trustee Viviano said okay, then Barton Malow is the construction manager.

Trustee Vitale asked if the trustees will go on tour once the facility is completed? Dr. Sawyer said absolutely, we will be proud to show it off.

Trustee Cusumano said that he noticed when he reviewed these materials that Clark Contracting Services was the lowest bidder on the acoustical ceiling tile, but they came in at over \$116,000 more on the architectural bid, so if it was all aggregated you don't know you are getting the best deal on each component.

ROLL CALL VOTE:

AYES: DiMaria, Flynn, Cusumano, Dean, Vitale, Viviano, Lorenzo

NAYS:

MOTION CARRIED.

12.0 [POLICY ACTIONS \(none\)](#)

13.0 [ADJOURNMENT](#)

MOTION by DiMaria, supported by Viviano, to adjourn the meeting.

The meeting adjourned at

COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT OF THE COUNTY OF MACOMB BOARD OF TRUSTEES

---

Secretary