

MINUTES OF THE INFORMATION SESSION OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES  
OF THE COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT OF THE COUNTY OF MACOMB

An open information session of the Board of Trustees of the Community College District of the County of Macomb was held Tuesday, April 21, 2015 at 6:00 p.m., in Room 109 of the Professional Development Center, University Center, Center Campus, 44575 Garfield Road, Clinton Township, Michigan.

1.0 CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Kelly at 6:37 p.m.

2.0 ROLL CALL

Present: James F. Kelly, Chairperson  
Christine Bonkowski, Vice Chairperson  
Jennifer Haase, Secretary  
Roseanne DiMaria, Treasurer  
Frank Cusumano, Trustee  
Vincent Viviano, Trustee

Absent: Joseph DeSantis, Trustee (excused)

Also present: James Jacobs, President  
Elizabeth Argiri, Vice President, Business  
Jill Thomas-Little, Vice President, Student Services  
Patricia Martz, Secretary to the President  
Gerri Lynn Pavone, Executive Director, Research  
and Planning  
James Sawyer, Provost/Senior Vice President, Learning Unit  
Casandra Ulbrich, Vice President, College Advancement  
and Community Relations  
Hunter L. Wendt, General Counsel/Executive  
Director, College Police  
Denise Williams, Vice President, Human Resources

3.0 APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Trustee Bonkowski announced her resignation, effective May 19, 2015. She stated that she has appreciated her years serving as a Trustee for the college and it has been a great privilege for her to work with the college and the community. Trustee Kelly stated that the community appreciates all of her support for the college over the past thirty years. Trustee Viviano stated that the college has been fortunate to have her on the Board for so long. President Jacobs stated that Trustee Bonkowski has always been a friend of the college, a supporter and a true leader and thanked her for her service. He acknowledged her many years of commitment to the college and stated that a reception in her honor will be planned in June.

Trustee Kelly stated the he would like to add an item under 6.2 Board Items to discuss the Trustee vacancy. It was agreed to add this to the information session agenda.

MOTION by Haase, supported by Bonkowski, to approve the Agenda as amended.

ALL IN FAVOR:

Ayes: Haase, Bonkowski, Cusumano, DiMaria, Viviano, Kelly

Nays: None

Absent: DeSantis

Motion carried.

#### 4.0 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION

None

#### 5.0 REVIEW OF AGENDA ITEMS AND MATERIAL

None

#### 6.0 ISSUES AND UPDATES

Dr. Jacobs handed out materials and a binder relating to data to be referred to later in the meeting.

Dr. Jacobs also referred to the advertising and marketing awards received by the college. He stated that the awards were received from the Collegiate Advertising Awards group. The college won a gold award for their winning entry as an institution with 20,000 plus students in "Website Design." Dr. Ulbrich stated that this gold award is for the website design around the "campaign for realstudents.macomb.edu" as well as a silver award for billboard design. She also stated that the college received a silver award for the college's "Total Digital Marketing Program, Macomb Fall 2014 Campaign." Lastly, the college received a bronze award for their digital "Macomb Recruitment Video."

Dr. Jacobs referred to a press release which highlighted Macomb's career academies. He explained that the college's career academies which are directed at high school students offer programs to younger students. Listed in the article are the career academies and their costs. Dr. Jacobs stated that the college has a new program that Dr. Sawyer discussed at the March meeting. He mentioned that Crain's Detroit Business will have an article about Macomb's clay modeling program called Digital Sculptor. Dr. Sawyer explained that the program is the convergence of the old clay modeling type programs with digital tools and was driven by Macomb's partnership with the ASC and General Motors.

Dr. Jacobs referred to an article in Crain's Detroit Business which discusses community colleges around the state and their struggle to fill classes. He noted that in the article there are issues that have been brought up by other institutions. The article revealed that enrollment in Michigan for all of the community colleges is down by approximately 6.2%. Macomb's data shows that enrollment is down by approximately 3.9% which indicates a percentage decrease that is a little more than half of what it is statewide.

Dr. Jacobs referred to two upcoming events that are coming up: 1) Michigan Community College Association (MCCA) Summer Conference July 23-24; and 2) Association of Community College Trustees (ACCT) Leadership Congress October 14-17 in San Diego, California.

Dr. Jacobs announced that Macomb College's math team won 1<sup>st</sup> place in the Midwest. Dr. Sawyer stated this is a new endeavor for the college. He also noted that Macomb had a couple of students that did very well last year and this year. One student from Macomb was third nationally. This competition is among two-year colleges, and 165 colleges in 35 states participated.

#### 6.1 Housekeeping Services Contract Discussion

Dr. Jacobs stated that this is a very important contract because it affects all of Macomb College's building and staff. He also stated that Ms. Argiri put together a great team of people to review the proposals.

Ms. Argiri stated that the process began last fall. An independent consultant was hired to help the team through the process and they began setting the timelines needed to achieve the deadline. Faculty and staff from all areas of the college were invited to participate in the process which was driven by the college's experience over the last three years. Steve Alton, Director of Facilities Management, and Dennis Costello, Purchasing Administrator, were very instrumental in the entire process and are available tonight to answer questions. In response to the request for proposals (RFP) which went out in February, 15 proposals were received, and based on the proposals, the finalists were narrowed down to four. The criteria on which the decision was based included a number of elements such as sufficient hours (which is the most critical aspect of the proposals), supervision, and experience requirements for the supervision (which was changed in the RFP). The contract would require that the account manager assigned to Macomb, as well as the night supervisors, meet certain experience requirements; five years for the account manager and three years for the night supervisors. Also looked at were the hourly rates each company paid their staff since experience has shown that when the hourly rates are low, there is a lot of turnover in staff which impacts the performance of the contract. For the past three years, the college worked with a company that did not have a local office. When this contract was put out for bid three years ago, the college did not realize how important that would be to the support of the contract. Therefore, this criteria was needed in terms of making a decision. Ms. Argiri stated that they also looked at the bid for consumables which is an important piece of the contract and the college required that the submission of information be presented in a certain format. The consultant provided an excel template for pricing. The template helped break down the different aspects of the proposal so comparisons of the proposals could be done quickly and outliers of the different components of the contract could be identified. The selection for this contract is not necessarily one of low bid. To select a vendor based on the lowest bid, the college would be

faced with even lower performance because the bid is based on hours, hourly rates, and the benefits for staff. The committee of twenty conducted interviews of the four companies and after completion of the interviews, the committee narrowed the companies down to two: 1) Professional Building Maintenance (PBM); 2) GCA Services Group. After the interviews, there was a lot of discussion regarding clarifications and questions, so we posed those back to the companies, received their responses, and again evaluated the final proposals. The committee agreed to recommend GCA Services Group to the Board for a number of reasons—their experience with higher education, specifically, Sinclair Community College, Dayton, Ohio and Cuyahoga Community College, Cleveland, Ohio. When references were checked, the references came back as excellent for these two institutions as well as their K-12 clients. The committee was very impressed overall with GCA's interview and their presentation. Of the four that were interviewed, GCA was ranked highest in terms of their presentation. They were very direct and thorough. The account manager that GCA will be providing to the college has several years of custodial experience which the college deems is necessary for the performance of this contract. GCA also recommended implementation of a Joint Review Committee, something which has not been done in the past. The purpose of this committee will be to meet with GCA on a schedule, whether monthly or quarterly, to discuss the college's satisfaction with GCA's services and to talk about any concerns, issues and resolutions to problems. GCA would use that forum to present any innovative ideas that they have in terms of cleaning and equipment. GCA also uses technology and communication to evaluate contract performance with respect to cleaning issues and timely resolution. Other vendors did not offer these options to the college. GCA is also a well-established, large company with \$1 billion dollars in revenue with 38,000 employees.

Trustee Viviano inquired as to whether GCA was union or non-union and whether they were in or out of state. Ms. Argiri responded that they are non-union and that they service 46 states. They are headquartered in Cleveland, Ohio and have a local office in Troy, Michigan. Trustee Cusumano inquired as to how long the contract was with the current provider, SBM, and the annual cost. Ms. Argiri responded that it was three years and the contract was the same structure with two years and a third year as an option to renew, and the current contract is approximately \$1.5 million dollars. She stated that this will be an increase, however, from Macomb's experience the last three years this was too low. SBM has been paying their employees minimum wage which resulted in quite a turnover in staff. Trustee Cusumano inquired as to what the new provider pays as an hourly wage. Ms. Argiri responded that they pay approximately \$11-\$12.50 per hour and they provide benefits to their hourly employees. In addition, the account manager and the lead night supervisors are given competitive wages and benefits. Trustee Cusumano inquired as to square footage and how the 79,000 in staffing hours were calculated. Ms. Argiri responded that the hours they are proposing for Macomb are based on the square footage. Trustee Kelly noted that it is based on the square footage and task. Ms. Argiri explained that there are different positions such as day porters versus nighttime cleaners. They are different positions with different hours. She further added that the consultant provides a standard template to calculate totals and summaries which allows for the comparison of all 15 proposals to ensure accuracy. Trustee Cusumano inquired if the annualized rates for the two-year contract remained at \$1.64 million or if there was an increase built into the contract. Ms. Argiri responded that for GCA the first two years are the same amount and the third year will increase by approximately \$25,000. Trustee Cusumano asked if the increase for the third year was a percentage or set amount. Ms. Argiri stated that the proposed set amounts are not going to change from what they

propose and they will be addressed in the contract. It is a fixed number and the college will work with general counsel to put a contract in place. For the third year, the cost will go up to \$1.672 million dollars, which is a small percentage.

Trustee Haase stated that she was very impressed by the process Ms. Argiri and the committee followed and how inclusive it was with involving staff. She also stated she believes it is important to have a verified staff with solid background checks. Ms. Argiri commented that GCA does thorough background checks on the staff they hire and they are held to those standards. She also stated that the current SBM staff will have the opportunity to interview for positions with GCA. Trustee Viviano inquired as to how many employees will be working at the college for GCA. Ms. Argiri responded that they will try to equate it to 39 employees. Some employees will be full-time and some part-time. Overall, they take all the hours and try to equate it to 39 full-time employees.

## 6.2 Board Items – Parliamentary Workshop

Trustee Kelly stated that Mr. Wendt has identified a person to conduct the Parliamentary training at the request of the Board, and Mr. Wendt has been negotiating dates with this individual. There was a discussion regarding the training with a new trustee starting in June. Trustee Kelly responded that he believes an individual can participate in the training on Parliamentary procedure before attending a board meeting. He proposed having the training at the end of May or sometime in June.

### 6.2A Trustee Vacancy

Trustee Kelly explained that the last time there was a trustee vacancy, the procedure followed was that the existing officers screened applicants and selected individuals to interview with the purpose of making a recommendation to the entire Board. The entire Board received copies of all the letters of interest and applicant information, however, it was just the officers that conducted interviews. Trustee Kelly further explained that the officers would make a recommendation and/or any member of the Board could make a recommendation. He also stated that it is not required to have a quorum or post the meeting. Trustee Cusumano stated that to his knowledge, the process that Trustee Kelly described is not covered by the bylaws, and believes it requires a vote. Mr. Wendt stated that it is the issue of the mechanism of filling vacancies that is not addressed, but what is addressed is the fact that it takes the majority of the Board to approve the next member. Once Trustee Bonkowski's resignation is effective, the Board will move expediently to fill the vacancy. Mr. Wendt noted this would be at the May board meeting which is the same date that the resignation would be effective.

Trustee Kelly stated that a public notice would be published stating that interested individuals will need to submit a letter of interest to [martzp@macomb.edu](mailto:martzp@macomb.edu). Ms. Martz would then distribute all submissions received to the members of the Board. Mr. Wendt responded that this is appropriate.

Trustee Cusumano requested that an appropriate resolution be prepared for Trustee Bonkowski's service to the college. Trustee Kelly requested a resolution be adopted at the May board meeting.

Trustee Kelly stated that he will make a motion at the regular board meeting to follow a process for people who are interested in filling the vacancy to submit a letter of interest to the Secretary to the President and she will distribute those submissions to all members of the Board, and that a committee of the current officers will review and make a recommendation to the Board at the May board meeting.

### 6.3 Data Update

Dr. Jacobs referred to a PowerPoint presentation and a binder of information prepared by the Institutional Research staff. The information in the binder is what Macomb uses on which to base their measurement in regard to the retention of students. He explained that this is the beginning of a work in progress. The culmination of this information relates to Trustee Cusumano's comments at the April board meeting regarding the data the college uses in terms of judging the college's effectiveness. He also noted that the presentation will tie this in with a national question emerging around data which is important because the college needs to have a way of analyzing student progress and student success. The current system that is used on the federal level is called the Integrated Postsecondary Education Data System (IPEDS) initiated in 1965. At that time, the overwhelming majority of students who went to college went to four-year universities. Approximately half of the community colleges in the country did not exist in 1965. Even though it is used by the federal government and the college participates in IPEDS, it does not fit very well with community college students and their progress since the IPEDS system has only one form of analysis. IPEDS analyzes those who start their first term as a full-time student and have never attended college anywhere else, which excludes two-thirds of Macomb's student body. In addition, IPEDS only includes students that have declared a program major in their first term, and approximately 25% of Macomb students have not declared a major in their first term.

Dr. Jacobs referred to the "IPEDS Five Year Student Data Table" slide. He explained that for the academic year 2013-2014, there were 33,646 students enrolled, 11,560 first-time students, 319 students that returned to the college after five years, and 2,764 students graduated. He referred to the "IPEDS Tracked" column for 2013-2014 where 681 Macomb students were tracked under the IPEDS system. He pointed out that Macomb has 33,646 students enrolled but the IPEDS data is based on 681 students which is 2% of Macomb's student body, so 98% of Macomb's students are not covered by the data that the federal government uses. IPEDS is an inefficient way for an institution to do its planning, and this is the reason for using other forms of data. He further explained that the college is utilizing Voluntary Framework of Accountability (VFA), which we are developing with 60 other community colleges. Dr. Sawyer leads a process at Macomb to utilize the VFA to collect data on Macomb and compare that data to other colleges.

Dr. Jacobs explained that the VFA looks at three groups of students. The first group is first-time students at Macomb. It can include high school students, transfer students, and full-time or part-time students (which is a much broader category that better fits the heterogeneity of Macomb's student body). The second group is credential seekers, students that have already earned 12 credits and are interested in continuing their education to receive some form of credential. The third group is similar to what IPEDS does—first time at any college with no prior undergraduate

college experience where the student can be full-time or part-time. Dr. Jacobs explained that we use these three categories as well as what approximately 60 other community colleges are using for tracking. IPEDS data is based on a view that community college students attend full-time and that it would take three years for a student to complete a degree or credential under their system. Most of Macomb's students and most other community college students do not attend full-time. The average number of credits a student takes at Macomb is nine, which is higher than at most other community colleges. Approximately half of all community college students, after six years, get some form of degree or completion in the process. Many articles written about community colleges state that 60% of community college students do not graduate. This data comes from the IPEDS analysis which is based on an extremely small number of people. Dr. Jacobs stated that he believes the VFA approach will be more successful. He also noted that the VFA tracks all students involved in career and technical education.

Trustee Kelly raised the question as to whether the VFA framework counts developmental students and what percentage of Macomb's new students take developmental courses. Dr. Sawyer responded that it is one of the criteria, which is the progression of developmental students through the developmental cycle. He further responded that in math it is approximately 50%, in English approximately 8%, and in reading approximately 15%. Trustee Kelly commented that this is a large number of students and much of the data does not count these students. Dr. Sawyer responded that since all community colleges face these challenges, the VFA specifically includes these students.

Dr. Jacobs provided a brief overview on profiles of Macomb's students in regard to gender, average age, and ethnicity. In regard to gender, he noted that it is interesting that all community colleges and most of higher education are dominated by women. Most community colleges are at 60% and some community colleges are up to 75%. At Macomb, the majority of students are female, but there are more male students than at most community colleges. The average age of a student at Macomb is decreasing as it is at most community colleges. One of the reasons for this is because Macomb has 1,000 high school students which is reflected in the data. In regard to ethnicity, there is a growth in minority students. In 2004, 80% of the students identified themselves as white, which is now down to 69%. In addition, looking at credit hour comparisons, approximately 25% of Macomb students attend full-time, but the growth in part-time is considerable. Students are taking longer to complete because they are working and may have families. Therefore, the college needs to design a coherent structure of classes and programs that includes part-time students. Dr. Jacobs stated that Macomb produces far more degrees than most community colleges. This is because the associate degree of general studies is increasingly becoming the degree of choice as opposed to the associate degree of applied science.

Ms. Pavone referred to a summary in the handout which explains IPEDS and VFA as well as some sample reports. There is also data that compares Macomb's data to some of the other institutions in the area for VFA and IPEDS. It shows what is typical of community colleges in the area. Schoolcraft and Wayne County Community College District are not included in the VFA because they are not member colleges of VFA. Trustee Cusumano inquired as to whether VFA uses the same definitions. Dr. Sawyer stated that there could be slight differences between college definitions, but there will not be wide discrepancies.

Trustee Cusumano inquired about the percentage of students employed and their minimum wage and stated that it is his understanding that it was only reportable if the institution advertised or promoted the employment figures. Dr. Sawyer responded that this is a challenge on a variety of fronts and we are hindered by not having access to employment wage data. Dr. Sawyer stated that we would like to have access to this data to know if the college is making a difference and truly helping. Trustee Cusumano inquired whether administration is on pace for establishing something on the VFA for a vote by the Board by September. Ms. Pavone responded that we have an internal data team who is working to determine outcome numbers and what we can impact and measure. She further stated that meetings began in February and they are scheduled through September. The team is hoping during that time to be able to make some recommendations. A date was not established as to when this will be brought to the Board.

Dr. Jacobs concluded by stating that approximately half of the colleges in Michigan are using the VFA, and that IPEDS is the current mandate so all colleges must participate in it. The Higher Education Act is going to be renewed and the question of how colleges measure success will be a large part of it. Community colleges will be asking Congress to keep the four-year colleges with the existing IPEDS format. Community colleges need a six-year window to measure students, not a three-year window.

Trustee Kelly requested setting aside time on the information session agenda at the May board meeting for further questions regarding this topic. Dr. Jacobs requested that questions be sent in advance in order to prepare.

#### 7.0 EXECUTIVE SESSION

It was determined that there was no need to hold an executive session.

#### 8.0 ADJOURNMENT

MOTION by DiMaria, supported by Haase, to adjourn the meeting.

The meeting adjourned at 7:42 p.m.

COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT OF THE COUNTY OF MACOMB  
BOARD OF TRUSTEES

---

Secretary