

MINUTES OF THE INFORMATION SESSION OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES
OF THE COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT OF THE COUNTY OF MACOMB

An open information session of the Board of Trustees of the Community College District of the County of Macomb was held Tuesday, March 17, 2015 in Room K307 of the John Lewis Student Community Center, South Campus, 14500 Twelve Mile Road, Warren, Michigan, pursuant to notice.

1.0 CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Kelly at 6:35 p.m.

2.0 ROLL CALL

Present: James F. Kelly, Chairperson
Christine Bonkowski, Vice Chairperson
Jennifer Haase, Secretary
Roseanne DiMaria, Treasurer
Frank Cusumano, Trustee
Vincent Viviano, Trustee

Absent: Joseph DeSantis, Trustee (excused)

Also present: James Jacobs, President
Jill M. Thomas-Little, Vice President, Student Services
Gerri Lynn Pavone, Executive Director,
Research and Planning
Cynthia Ranger, Administrative Assistant
James Sawyer, Provost/Senior Vice President, Learning Unit
Casandra Ulbrich, Vice President, College Advancement
and Community Relations
Hunter L. Wendt, General Counsel/Executive
Director, College Police
Denise Williams, Vice President, Human Resources

3.0 APPROVAL OF AGENDA

MOTION by Bonkowski, supported by DiMaria, to approve the agenda as presented.

ALL IN FAVOR:

Ayes: Bonkowski, DiMaria, Cusumano, Haase, Viviano, Kelly

Nays: None

Absent: DeSantis

Motion carried.

4.0 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION

None

5.0 REVIEW OF AGENDA ITEMS AND MATERIAL

Dr. Jacobs pointed out that the February 17, 2015 unapproved minutes for 6.3 Tuition reads May. The correct month is March. Trustee Kelly noted the change.

6.0 ISSUES AND UPDATES

6.1 Institutional Development Day – March 31, 2015

Dr. Jacobs distributed the agenda for Institutional Development Day (IDD) which will take place on Tuesday, March 31 on Center Campus. He stated this is the day where the entire staff of the college gets together. The retirees are honored and he presents the State of the College address to staff. Dr. Jacobs extended an invitation to the Board members to attend IDD. He explained that the event is planned by a committee of college staff that includes faculty, administration, maintenance, etc., where all groups send representatives. Ms. Pavone represents the President's Office in the planning process. Some of the highlights are the PowerPoint presentation of the year in review and the retiree reception.

6.0 ISSUES AND UPDATES (Continued)

6.2 Skilled Trades

Dr. Jacobs informed the Board that the college was awarded a grant by the Governor's Office and that the college is involved in Federal Skilled Trades training. Dr. Sawyer stated that there is a push for skilled trades training from employers, and that the Governor mentioned this at the Education Economic Summit. The State is launching a media campaign under the Pure Michigan talent connect theme to create enthusiasm among young people about a career in the skilled trades.

Dr. Sawyer mentioned that Macomb received an equipment grant from the State in the amount of \$2.8 million to support Macomb's technical programs. The additional funding will help procure up-to-date equipment, expand our capacity, and includes equipment purchases such as welding simulators, mechatronics equipment, an automatic transmission dynamometer, and a 3D printer. The funding will also be used to update existing mechatronics equipment at the college. Dr. Sawyer pointed out that the M-TEC equipment is dated, about 10 years old, and the additional funding will allow us to update our training. Additionally, the timing is ideal as the work we are doing with General Motors and Ford fits nicely in this area.

Dr. Sawyer mentioned other developments in the area of skilled trades, including the State launch of the Department of Talent and Economic Development. At the Federal level, an initiative called the American Apprenticeship Initiative, led by the Department of Labor (DOL), will award approximately 25 grants across the country totaling approximately \$100 million dollars. Macomb College intends to submit a joint proposal with Grand Rapids Community College (GRCC) focusing on career pathways in apprenticeships. We will work closely with the Macomb Intermediate School District (MISD) and local school districts to try to create a career pathway for students in apprenticeships and in the skilled trades areas.

Dr. Sawyer commented upon the success of the Product Development Academy which was the first career and technical education program as part of the Early College. He noted that it has been very well received by General Motors. The college sees this as an opportunity to expand skilled trades programs. Dr. Sawyer also stated that another feature we are going to build into the grant proposal are stackable credentials with the Manufacturing Skill Standards Council (MSSC) in apprenticeship programs as well as leverage the work in our M-CAM activities.

Dr. Sawyer added that in this past year the college has been working on a program called "Digital Sculptor." He gave an example of the old clay models in the automotive industry, and this is like combining that kind of talent along with people who have sophisticated computer skills to do digital modeling as well.

6.0 ISSUES AND UPDATES (Continued)

6.2 Skilled Trades (Continued)

Dr. Sawyer stated that the college will try to present this as an apprenticeable trade. The DOL is interested in determining whether there are new trades they should be looking at. In addition to having GRCC as part of this joint proposal, we have secured the support of the United Auto Workers (UAW). Historically, the UAW has been one of the more prominent suppliers of students for the college in the skilled trades area. In the past few years we have seen a significant increase in the number of apprenticeships, up 60% from Fall 2013 to Winter 2015. There are 236 apprentices which is reflective of the demand from our local employers. In addition to the increase in students, there is a 53% increase in the number of companies from Fall 2013 to Winter 2015. The attraction of companies is beneficial to the college because as they move forward, they bring additional apprentices on board. Trustee Cusumano inquired as to how many companies are now participating, and as to the number of students before the 60% increase. Dr. Sawyer responded that 46 companies are participating and the number of students was 140 before the increase.

Trustee Cusumano inquired as to what fields the college offers in terms of apprenticeships. Dr. Sawyer responded that the college offers courses in any skilled trade. There are an estimated 330 courses in the Applied Technology area. He also explained that Macomb will build a curriculum around those courses to meet the companies' needs, and allow them to customize their program with our existing courses. The majority of our apprentices have been in the manufacturing and construction related areas. There are about 1,000 DOL approved apprenticeable trades, but our focus is in the manufacturing and construction areas.

Dr. Sawyer stated that the college's Apprenticeship Coordinator, Vikki Gordon does a fabulous job and is very well received by employers and is able to articulate the benefits of the apprenticeship program.

Trustee Cusumano asked if the college is moving in the direction of career academies for K-12. Dr. Sawyer responded that in the summer, Macomb always presents career academies in a number of different areas. He also explained that the K-12, Early College, and the Product Development Academy are something we would like to expand into other career and technological education areas. He further explained that Product Development consists of taking college design courses for college credit in a career area. We have students coming to the college in a dual enrollment capacity taking Center for Technical Education (CTE) and career technical education courses. Dr. Sawyer mentioned that we have ongoing conversations with Scott Palmer, Technical Coordinator at the MISD about different arrangements with the school district, and that the college is very open to providing these kinds of programs. Macomb College has become a great resource for them because a lot of the school systems have closed their CTE programs.

6.0 ISSUES AND UPDATES (Continued)

6.2 Skilled Trades (Continued)

Dr. Jacobs stated that in the long run we will see more high schools and community colleges working together because the equipment is very expensive. He stated that with automotive technology, schools need to have certain levels of equipment to be certified; and Macomb has that. The challenge will be merging that together with the school districts. The college is very well positioned in this work and it is an area that will expand.

6.3 Lansing Update

Dr. Jacobs stated that the college is still awaiting the budget determination which has not been signed by the Governor. Therefore, funding is still uncertain. The legislators are projecting a 1.5% increase.

6.4 Frida & Cultural Activities

Dr. Jacobs passed around the Frida program which he stated was very impressive. This was the Midwest Premiere of Frida at the Macomb Center for Performing Arts on Saturday, March 7, with another performance on Sunday, March 8. This is a major production and the first time the Michigan Opera Theatre (MOT) held a performance outside of its own building. Dr. Jacobs stated that this has really put the college in a whole new arena of cultural activities.

Dr. Jacobs further stated that the MOT was very impressed with the college and they plan to come back next year. He believes the college will continue to have a regular relationship with the MOT. The Chief Operating Officer from the Detroit Institute of Arts attended. The event was written up in the New York Times and in local newspapers with great reviews. Dr. Jacobs urged everyone to go to the DIA to see the Frida Kahlo and Diego Rivera exhibit.

Dr. Ulbrich stated that there were about 200 people at the Gala Event before the March 7 performance. Dr. Jacobs stated that the gala was very well done and was good exposure for the college. For many people from the MOT that attended the Gala, this was their first visit to the college.

6.0 ISSUES AND UPDATES (Continued)

Dr. Jacobs announced that during the American Association of Community Colleges (AACC) Convention, on April 17, he will be receiving one of the 20 Phi Theta Kappa Honor Society's prestigious Shirley B. Gordon Awards of Distinction, named in honor of Phi Theta Kappa's longest serving Board Chair, founder and long-time President of Highline Community College in Washington. College presidents and campus chief executive officers are nominated by their local Phi Theta Kappa chapter based upon their outstanding support of Phi Theta Kappa. Dr. Jacobs stated that this is an honor for him and for the college.

Dr. Jacobs announced that he will be speaking at a conference in Belfast, Ireland on June 8.

DISCUSSION: Dr. Jacobs suggested changing the date of the Tuesday, July 21 Board of Trustees meeting because it falls during the same week as the Michigan Community College Association (MCCA) Summer Conferences in Traverse City which includes the President and Trustees Summer Institute. Dr. Jacobs also raised the possibility of not having a July meeting, stating that unless there are items that present themselves or if there is some type of an emergency that occurs in July, we may be able to forego the July meeting. Mr. Wendt suggested cancelling the meeting but it would be subject to a special meeting request. All agreed to this suggestion and it will be voted on at the April 21 Board meeting.

Dr. Jacobs announced that Patty Martz has formally announced her retirement effective this summer.

Dr. Jacobs talked about two upcoming conferences that the Trustees may be interested in attending: 1) MCCA Summer Conference in Traverse City July 22-24 and 2) National Association of Community College Trustees (ACCT) Leadership Congress in San Diego, California October 14-17. Dr. Jacobs encouraged the Trustees to attend and requested that the Trustees notify his office if they plan to attend.

Trustee Cusumano inquired about Elizabeth Lucas, candidate for the Instructor of Nursing, Psychiatric Mental Health position, listed in Agenda Item 8.1 for voting at the 7:30 p.m. regular meeting as to what courses she had taught at Oakland University and as to the number of applicants there were. Ms. Williams stated that Ms. Lucas's experience is in Psychiatric Nursing and there were three qualified applicants. Trustee Cusumano also inquired as to what "overload compensation up to \$28,000" meant. Ms. Williams explained that it is extra contractual. For example, the base salary is based on the fall and winter semesters, however, if a person works through the spring and summer, there could be extra money earned. Cusumano inquired as to Ms. Lucas' starting salary. Ms. Williams responded she is starting at step five at the fall wages.

6.0 ISSUES AND UPDATES (Continued)

Trustee Cusumano brought up the issue of tuition. He mentioned he went to the Adult Education Survey (AES) National Center for Education Statistics site and asked if the data set is treated by college. Dr. Jacobs asked if he was looking at the United States Department of Education, Integrated Postsecondary Education Data System (IPEDS) dataset. Trustee Cusumano responded that it was. He also noted that it was Higher Education Opportunities Act (HEOA) compliant 2008. This had Macomb College ranked 47% higher than from 2012-2013 at \$6,598. Trustee Cusumano inquired as to how this was calculated. Dr. Jacobs stated he would need to look at it directly. However, the way they calculate community colleges, IPEDS data assumes that someone is not living at home and pays rent. He further explained that it is not just the cost of tuition and books, it is also the living expenses they incur. Trustee Cusumano inquired as to whether cost of living is factored in. Dr. Jacobs responded that students at community colleges generally live at home or live with their families so it is not a cost that they bear in the same way in most cases, so the tendency is not to look at it. A more accurate measurement is tuition, books and expenses. Dr. Jacobs further explained that this is how FAFSA is determined. This is a huge problem in education because there are different organizations that use the same terms but have different definitions, and this is why you see much different figures.

Trustee Cusumano inquired as to the accuracy of the calculators available online. He noted that there were templates online set up by the Department of Education. Dr. Jacobs stated that it is still relatively new, so there are still a lot of issues. He explained that the data referenced in FAFSA is more compelling because it has been in existence for a much longer time. If you refer to the FAFSA calculations on what it costs to go to college, then you can compare. He stated FAFSA is based on the IRS and tax returns. Trustee Kelly stated that it might be helpful to agree on what data we want to look at and what data we want to use, and then collect the data. That way we know what type of data is being used and what assumptions are being made. He also stated that when you look at the Federal Government compiling data from all over the country, you get into what are the underlying assumptions being made, and it gets very difficult.

Trustee Cusumano stated that all institutions are participating in Title IV funding and these are requirements. He raised the question about the college's metrics on student success, for example, retention rates. He wanted to know if the college is working in this direction. Dr. Jacobs stated that less than 2% of our students fit into the definition they use. These are first time, full-time students at Macomb College. He explained that the college has the data, and if you extend that from 3 years to 6 years, you can see a dramatic change in the amount of students that complete a degree and then go to a 4-year school, and possibly complete a 4-year degree.

Trustee Cusumano raised the topic of benchmarking. Dr. Jacobs mentioned that Dr. Sawyer has been involved in a national effort by community colleges named Voluntary Framework for Accountability (VFA). Dr. Sawyer stated that this is a work in progress. There has been progress made, but there have been some systemic issues and it is getting better. It is not to the point where it can be used effectively for benchmarking, but that is a long-term goal.

6.0 ISSUES AND UPDATES (Continued)

Trustee Kelly stated that the danger of searching for data is that everyone is working with data with different assumptions and is working with different definitions, and unless you can sort through all of that, it is very hard to compare one set of data versus another one. He further stated that even though everyone is reporting, how they are reporting the data is not necessarily the same. National organizations are also struggling with this. Trustee Cusumano stated that Oakland Community College has VFA data set up on their website so they are moving in that direction. He also stated that there is a spectrum that is going on with reporting requirements and that there must be some type of framework. Dr. Sawyer responded that one of the big challenges with the VFA is that they are trying to achieve agreed upon definitions. The feedback they are trying to rectify is to nail that down because it needs to be 100% compliant or it is of no use. The goal of the VFA is to get to that point.

Trustee Haase stated that a lot of the national data through the Department of Education, including the southern states, is going to skew the whole data scheme because of the cost of living. They run very different programs than in the Midwest and on both coasts. There are the same problems when you compare the K-12 system on the Department of Education's website because there are different regulations in each state as to what is reported and how it is reported, what kind of dashboard they are using, if they are using any kind of dashboard at all. Because the data is all over the place, it is really hard to get an accurate picture.

Trustee Cusumano explained that he ran a filtered search of 50 miles from zip code 48088 and it brought up Oakland, Macomb, Wayne, Schoolcraft, and Washtenaw Community Colleges. Trustee Cusumano referred to a bell curve relating to graduation rates and he feels it is important to see a bell curve regarding graduation rates and how long it takes for completion.

Ms. Pavone stated that Macomb has a data team working on this and Dr. Sawyer, Ms. Thomas-Little, the Director of Institutional Research, and other key data staff within these units are a part of that team. What we are looking at is putting together national data to see what we are reporting and determine what is meaningful and track internal data. Ms. Pavone also stated that we will put together recommendations in terms of what will be useful internally to make decisions. Then we will bring that back to the Board to see if that information is useful to you as board members in terms of making decisions. Then we would like to get input from all of the Board members. She further stated that we are trying to do that in a structured manner. She explained that meetings started in February another meeting is scheduled in April. There are meetings scheduled every six weeks through September 2016 to try to keep these discussions on track. Trustee Cusumano wanted to know when this data may be available. Ms. Pavone stated that discussions just started and we identified student populations that are important to look at, and are starting to work on the metrics. There is a schedule to do this between now and September 2016 and this is the timeframe in which we are trying to work within.

6.0 ISSUES AND UPDATES (Continued)

Dr. Jacobs stated that this is difficult because in K-12, people enter and usually proceed grade by grade. The heterogeneity of the students that we serve, a great many of them may come from high school but many may be older who have worked for a number of years, and some come from other countries. The diversity of the learning experience means it is very hard to do any kind of cohorts in terms of research, not just one individual. The way the University of Michigan can do things is very different from what Macomb College can do. If you started at University of Michigan, there are distinctions when you start in fall, winter, or spring. Macomb College has none of these distinctions. We use credit hours. Some people earn 8 credit hours, some 12 and others only take 4 credits. If a student takes 4 credits each semester for 6 years, is this progress? The heterogeneity makes it hard to figure out how we evaluate our success. Is it the grades they get, whether they get a better job, is it the degree, does the degree lead to a transfer? Dr. Jacobs stated that the majority of Macomb College students who transfer never complete a degree at Macomb.

Trustee Kelly stated that if you do not achieve a degree, it is counted as a failure. Achieving a degree is how adequate progress is defined. He also stated that many Macomb College students do not transfer in two years.

Trustee Cusumano stated that this institution has a tremendous amount of data.

Dr. Jacobs stated it is trying to figure out from that amount of data the four or five things that are seen as critical. He stated that there are all sorts of issues that the college struggles with. The questions of accountability and how we are accountable is something to keep in mind. The legislature holds us accountable in other ways than IPEDS.

Trustee Cusumano stated that he believes it is fundamental in America that everyone should be able to educate themselves to advance economically. He also remarked that if you start stringing off accountability on revenue sources, it is different than what we should be doing as an institution about benchmarking.

Trustee Kelly stated that it is a great dialog to have, however, it is also important to agree on definitions. He also stated that he is a big proponent to open access for anyone that wants to advance themselves. However, it is important to recognize that by most measurements, many community college students are considered a failure. If you come to Macomb College and take one or two courses to improve your skills on a job, that is part of what we are about. Most measurements would say that this is a failure because the student did not leave with a degree or a certificate in three or four years.

6.0 ISSUES AND UPDATES (Continued)

Dr. Jacobs referred to an article in the Macomb Daily that Trustee Cusumano contributed to in regard to tuition. The article mentioned that Trustee Cusumano will vote no and continue to vote no on a tuition increase at the college until Macomb County household incomes recover. Dr. Jacobs inquired as to whether Trustee Cusumano is using household income as a determination of his vote on tuition as opposed to the data of the institution. Trustee Cusumano responded, absolutely. Dr. Jacobs explained that the reason the college collects data is to measure performance. Dr. Jacobs asked Trustee Cusumano if the income of the people in the community, regardless of the performance of the college, determines his vote on tuition. Trustee Cusumano responded, absolutely. Dr. Jacobs explained that student success is connected to tuition. Trustee Cusumano commented that student success does not improve when you spend more money and have declining enrollment. He also commented that when you take into account the income of the students and income of the people in the community, and the tuition being charged by the institution, the relationship is affordability. Dr. Jacobs explained that there is a relationship between what is done internally in an institution and the measurements of success.

Trustee Haase stated that referring back to the data, the relationship is very clear in regard to accessibility at this institution and many other institutions. Pell grants and other forms of financial aid are substantial and you have to weigh that with what this institution has to do to sustain the high quality of education that is delivered at the college. She also commented that from her service in Lansing, Macomb College is considered a premiere community college in the United States. When you take the funding hits over the years by the Legislature, this is a factor to consider as well. Trustee Haase noted that the college needs to be sensitive to the needs of the students. The college is doing that by providing them with counseling opportunities to get the financial aid necessary to attend college. She stated that by looking at the data, Macomb is doing that by helping people who cannot afford to attend. Trustee Haase referred to an example where people are able to make choices when it comes to spending. Some people can afford to choose whether to make a purchase at Starbucks or purchase a beer while there are others that do not have this choice. For the people that cannot afford to make these kinds of choices, they are benefiting from the financial aid and the college is assisting them. If a student is not pursuing financial aid, and it is needed, there is a level of personal responsibility. All of these factors need to be considered in making a decision, not just a single thing.

7.0 EXECUTIVE SESSION

It was determined that there was no need to hold an executive session.

8.0 ADJOURNMENT

MOTION by Bonkowski, supported by Viviano, to adjourn the meeting.

The meeting adjourned at 7:30 p.m.

COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT OF THE COUNTY OF MACOMB
BOARD OF TRUSTEES

Secretary