

APPROVED MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES OF THE COMMUNITY  
COLLEGE DISTRICT OF THE COUNTY OF MACOMB

A regular meeting of the Board of Trustees of the Community College District of the County of Macomb was held Wednesday, April 18, 2018 at 7:30 p.m., in Lecture Hall B, University Center, Professional Development Center, Center Campus, 44575 Garfield Road, Clinton Township, Michigan.

1.0 CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Haase at 7:55 p.m.

2.0 ROLL CALL

Present: Jennifer Haase, Chairperson  
Frank Cusumano, Vice Chairperson  
Katherine Lorenzo, Secretary  
Roseanne DiMaria, Treasurer  
Kristi Dean, Trustee  
Joseph DeSantis, Trustee

Absent: Vincent Viviano, Trustee

Also present: James Sawyer, President  
Sharon Kowal, Executive Administrative Assistant to the President  
Hunter L. Wendt, General Counsel

3.0 APPROVAL OF AGENDA

MOTION by Lorenzo, supported by DiMaria, to approve the agenda with the removal of Agenda Item 8.1.B.

ALL IN FAVOR:

Ayes: Lorenzo, DiMaria, Cusumano, Dean, DeSantis, Haase

Nays:

Absent: Viviano

Motion carried.

4.0 APPROVAL OF MINUTES

4.1 Information Session, March 21, 2018

MOTION by Cusumano, supported by DiMaria, to approve the minutes of the March 21, 2018 Information Session, as read.

ALL IN FAVOR:

Ayes: Cusumano, DiMaria, Dean, DeSantis, Lorenzo, Haase

Nays:

Absent: Viviano

Motion carried.

4.2 Executive Session, March 21, 2018

MOTION by Cusumano, supported by DiMaria, to approve the minutes of the March 21, 2018 Executive Session, as read.

ALL IN FAVOR:

Ayes: Cusumano, DiMaria, Dean, DeSantis, Lorenzo, Haase

Nays:

Absent: Viviano

Motion carried.

4.3 Regular Meeting, March 21, 2018

MOTION by Cusumano, supported by Lorenzo, to approve the minutes of the March 21, 2018 Regular Meeting, as read.

ALL IN FAVOR:

Ayes: Cusumano, Lorenzo, Dean, DeSantis, DiMaria, Haase

Nays:

Absent: Viviano

Motion carried.

5.0 BOARD OF TRUSTEES REPORTS/PROPOSALS

5.1 Board of Trustees Reports (verbal)

None.

6.0 PRESIDENT'S REPORT (verbal)

None.

7.0 FINANCIAL REPORTS

7.1 Financial Statements – March 31, 2018

MOTION by DiMaria, supported by DeSantis, to receive and file the financial statements for the nine months ended March 31, 2018.

ALL IN FAVOR:

Ayes: DiMaria, DeSantis, Cusumano, Dean, Lorenzo, Haase

Nays:

Absent: Viviano

Motion carried.

7.2 Investment Report – April 1, 2018

MOTION by DiMaria, supported by Dean, to receive and file the investment report of securities held as of April 1, 2018.

ALL IN FAVOR:

Ayes: DiMaria, Dean, DeSantis, Lorenzo, Haase

Nays: Cusumano

Absent: Viviano

Motion carried.

8.0 PERSONNEL REPORTS

8.1 Personnel Actions

8.1.A. – Michael Lafferty, Administrator, I.T. Delivery Lead

MOTION by Lorenzo, supported by Dean to approve the appointment of Michael Lafferty, Administrator, I.T. Delivery Lead.

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Ayes: Lorenzo, Dean, Cusumano, DeSantis, DiMaria, Haase

Nays:

Absent: Viviano

Motion carried.

9.0 AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION (verbal)

Mr. Larry Zamblin, a Macomb County taxpayer, stated that he was appalled this week when he received a ballot proposal from Macomb County Community College for a renewal that is not due for two years and you're asking for us to vote on an off election month. We have two elections coming up, one in August as a primary and a general State election in November and you called for a May 8 election. He would like to know the rationale and justification for that and for the cost. He understands the cost is in the six figures. He'd like to know how you can justify that.

Trustee Haase said the guidelines for audience participation provide members of the audience an opportunity to speak for two minutes, the Board will take notes and thank you for your participation.

Mr. Zamblin said you are hoodwinking the public is what you are doing.

Trustee Haase thanked him for his opinion.

Mr. Michael Lesich, from Fraser, said he actually came here tonight to speak about Item 8.1.B but it was removed from the agenda. He is a resident of Fraser and has been for 19 years. He is also a current city councilman for the City of Fraser. He came here tonight to congratulate you on your wise choice and affirm your decision to appoint George Rouhib the director of the Public Service Institute. But since it is not on the agenda he would like to simply say please, he hopes that it is on a future agenda. He has had the pleasure of being a resident that has been protected by that public safety department for 19 years. He has the pleasure of working with Mr. Rouhib for the last two years as a member of council. He can tell the Board that he is a man of great integrity, leadership and responsibility and he would be a great choice for this institution.

Trustee Haase thanked him.

Audience Participation – Continued

Mr. Al Hebert, retired art professor from the College, retired in August 2011 after 45 years of service. Prior to his retirement he did an inventory of the art collection that the College owns. Because of his contacts with various personnel at the College, in subsequent years, he had learned that there were disappearances, damages and destructions of some of these artworks. He contacted Jim Jacobs to see about rectifying the situation and he gave Dean Pritchett the assignment of re-inventorying the collection. That was in 2016. To his knowledge that inventory has never been updated and he thinks the situation is deplorable and ought to be addressed by the Board because he doesn't see the Administration addressing it. Thank you.

Trustee Haase thanked him.

10.0 REPORTS OF ADMINISTRATION – INFORMATION ITEMS

None.

11.0 REPORTS OF ADMINISTRATION – ACTION ITEMS11.1 Donations – March 31, 2018

MOTION by DiMaria, supported by Dean, to accept the donations as presented and acknowledged by the Administration.

ALL IN FAVOR:

Ayes: DiMaria, Dean, DeSantis, Lorenzo, Haase

Nays: Cusumano

Absent: Viviano

Motion carried.

11.2 Change Orders - none

### 11.3 Authorization for Purchases

#### 11.3A Learning Management System ("LMS") Renewal

MOTION by Lorenzo, supported by DiMaria that the Board of Trustees authorize the Administration to enter into a 36-month contract with Instructure of Salt Lake City, UT for the Canvas Learning Management System, subject to the approval of General Counsel, in an amount not to exceed \$653,302.90.

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Ayes: Lorenzo, DiMaria, Cusumano, Dean, DeSantis, Haase

Nays:

Absent: Viviano

Motion carried.

#### 11.3B Database Managed Services

MOTION by DiMaria, supported by Lorenzo that the Board of Trustees authorize the Administration to enter into a contract, upon approval of General Counsel, with Ferrilli, Inc. of Haddonfield, NJ to provide database system support and administration for up to three years in an amount not to exceed \$263,000. This amount includes a 5% contingency to cover unexpected or out-of-scope problem resolution assistance.

DISCUSSION: Trustee Cusumano asked Michael Zimmerman, CIO, who was doing this this type of work before. Mr. Zimmerman said that right now there is no one performing professional SQL database administration services for the College. Trustee Cusumano asked what's been our reliability rate as a result of us not having someone do that versus having this contract with Ferrilli. Mr. Zimmerman stated that it is not as good as it should be. Well below his threshold of acceptable performance. Trustee Cusumano asked if there is a hard figure for that or does the write-up show what they are proposing to be their level of reliability. Mr. Zimmerman responded that he does have those metrics, but not with him tonight. He can provide them to the Board outside of the meeting if they would like. Well below 90 percent, that is what the SLA has been on our database administration for some time. Trustee Cusumano asked if there is a reason why we can't do this in-house. Mr. Zimmerman said 1) we could perform these services in-house while there is somebody onsite, a single shift. The challenge that we have is that while staff typically only use our systems during normal business hours, the larger percentage of our stakeholders, which are faculty and students, typically tend to use these systems off hours, between the hours of 5 p.m. and 6 a.m., Saturdays, Sundays, holidays, 24/7 365. The challenge we have is there isn't a possible and equitable way to provide the level of support we need to provide to do it internally. The kind of expertise that you are looking for typically demands a salary of about \$100,000 to \$160,000 per year.

DISCUSSION -Continued

Trustee Cusumano said as he understands it we have a duplicate system. Mr. Zimmerman said we have two small data centers. There are hardware and software instances of our complete systems on both data centers that have to be programmed to work together in case of a catastrophic disaster at one of the other campuses. The level of expertise needed to manage that system and maintain the kind of performance his customers, which are the Board, students, faculty and staff, expect is something we cannot do internally by ourselves. Not with our existing staff. Trustee Cusumano said as he understands it is cooked right into the redundancy there should be reliability -- that is the reason why the redundancy exists. Mr. Zimmerman said yes, but somebody still has to maintain those links and make sure those systems perform properly.

Trustee Cusumano said as he understands it Ferrilli is based out of Haddonfield, NJ - are they going to have someone onsite or close by or is it all done through the cloud and Internet? Mr. Zimmerman replied that one of the factors that drove us to choose Ferrilli is because the SQL database programmer happens to reside in the state of Michigan. While the company is out of New Jersey they, like most managed service companies, have their support staff spread across the whole United States. With him living in Michigan that does give us the opportunity to have him on the premises in short order if it were to be necessary. Trustee Cusumano asked where he lives in Michigan. Kevin LaBonty, Director Business Information Services, responded that he lives within a couple of hours, in Mid-Michigan. Trustee Cusumano asked if he is basically sitting by the phone waiting for the call to come and that's what we are paying for. Mr. Zimmerman said it is more than that. Their responsibility as part of the firm that provides these services, is they set up the services that do the measuring, the monitoring and the alerting. They have alerts setup so if there is an issue at 2 a.m. the alarm goes off and they have a certain period of time, contractually within this agreement, to be able to triage the problem and bring the systems back up. Trustee Cusumano asked how many times has there been a failure of the systems with the redundancy in the last two years. Mr. Zimmerman said three and one was over 24 hours. During that period of time there was no registration, no Canvas access, no Internet, no documentation, nobody could get into the system. Trustee Cusumano asked how many slowdowns occur. Mr. Zimmerman said at least four or five times a quarter. We have performance issues. Trustee Cusumano asked if the contract covers total shutdowns and slowdowns. Mr. Zimmerman said yes. Trustee Cusumano asked what the recourse is in the event that we wind up having the same problem with frequency. Mr. Zimmerman said the contract is based on an industry term, SLA, which is Service Level Agreement. We set a threshold that they have to maintain and if they fail to meet that uptime threshold then there is a financial reimbursement to us for the services being paid. There is also an out clause in the contract where we can leave them and find somebody else.

Trustee Cusumano asked what would happen if the Board didn't pass this? Mr. Zimmerman said this is a matter of trying to figure out how much these systems are worth, what is the level IT risk that the Board and the Administration of the College are willing to accept. It's like buying an insurance policy for your car. If you never have an accident then you are okay, but that one time you have an accident you are thankful

DISCUSSION -Continued

that you are covered. For us this means you have bought an insurance policy where you have qualified, certified people that know what they are doing, watching our systems willing to react on Easter Sunday, if that's what it takes, to bring the system back up within a few hours. Today, between himself, Mr. LaBonty, and Mr. Lafferty trying to find someone who is willing to pick up a phone at 2 a.m., have them try to log on to the system and see if they can fix the problem. But especially with SQL, he doesn't have any qualified, certified SQL DBA's because they won't come to Macomb for the amount we are able to pay them. That is the dilemma for us. To answer your question, it is just a calculated risk that if nothing goes wrong and everything works fine, which typically has not been the case for Macomb's very complex system and the number of students we have hitting it, we might just be paying money for an insurance policy that we never use. He would much rather have these systems run and never have to worry about invoking that insurance policy but that's not typically the case. That is the reason he is standing before them saying this is a good thing for the College. It is a good thing for our students, and it is a good thing for our faculty because without these foundations always being available we can't provide the services that our students pay for and that we pay our staff to perform.

Trustee DeSantis stated that he has known Mr. Zimmerman since day one. You are extremely competent and it is a joy to see you presenting every time. You are really a great presenter. He really doesn't understand much of what Mr. Zimmerman says but you do it in such a jovial and wonderful way that if he could indulge him he would like to defer to our resident expert, Dr. Dean, if she has any questions in that area it would help him out. Thank you.

Trustee Dean said the SLA for Ferrilli right now is 99.5 - literally no downtime. Mr. Zimmerman said yes, he thinks it works out to minutes a month. Trustee Dean asked if they are going to be financially penalized if they do go under that, even at 99.4. Mr. Zimmerman said yes and it is going to be a tiered financial reward back to us, depending on how bad they perform. Trustee Dean asked if they are going to be watching the slow time during registration or the heavy times when the server has the hit. Mr. Zimmerman said this is actually one of the jobs of Michael Lafferty, the personnel appointment you just approved. One of the things that the College will now have is somebody who concentrates on managing these contracts with our vendors. The College has twenty some cloud systems and every one of them have this Service Level Agreement associated with them. But with all of these contracts it is up to the customer to go back to the vendor and say this isn't performing the way that it should. The difference between those kind of contracts and SLA agreements and the one we are inking with Ferrilli is they are now required and being paid to monitor. It is their responsibility to monitor, he's not saying we totally trust that because it is trust but verified. Mr. Lafferty's job is to verify that they are doing what that contract requires them to provide us.

Trustee Dean asked if this doesn't get approved tonight is there any way you can, during that heavy load for the server farm, take these redundancies and put more load on one server versus another? Is there any way you can do that? Mr. Zimmerman said the



DISCUSSION -Continued

challenge for us is we never know what the issue is; is it a software bug, is it a virus that has been launched, is there hardware failure and that is the difficulty. Internally we don't have the competencies, nor do we have the resources in the evenings and off hours, to be able to triage these problems and solve them in a quick way. Trustee Dean said it did sound like the downtimes are generally 8 a.m. to 5 p.m. Mr. Zimmerman responded no, they are not. On Christmas Eve last year he had six people in the data center working until 5 a.m. because we had systems down that we couldn't bring back up. We just don't have that trained competency to keep up with these technologies because there are just too many of them for us to support. What the modernization plan is doing is trying to take those critical key services that are very difficult for us to guarantee up time for our clients and pay somebody to do it who can do it much better than we can. And probably less expensive if we try to do it ourselves. If we were to try to do it ourselves he has to be able to hire three SQL DBA's. Compared to what they can make at GM a good SQL DBA won't come here. That is the dilemma, so he has to buy what he can get. Looking at the whole contract, what we are really buying is forty hours a month of DBA time at \$165 an hour. Trustee Dean asked if they had to physically be onsite. Mr. Zimmerman said no this is all remote, they don't have to be here.

Trustee Cusumano asked if we had backup generators. Mr. Zimmerman said yes, both data centers have full-size generators that not only backup the data centers but backup all of the switch closets so the entire network and the phones for emergency purposes stay live.

## ROLL CALL VOTE:

Ayes: DiMaria, Lorenzo, Cusumano, Dean, DeSantis, Haase

Nays:

Absent: Viviano

Motion carried.

11.3C GM Transmission Assemblies

MOTION by DiMaria, supported by Lorenzo that the Board of Trustees authorize the purchase of thirty (30) GM transmission assemblies in the amount of \$87,303 from LaFontaine Buick of Highland, MI.

DISCUSSION: Trustee Cusumano stated that the purchasing policy was followed in all of these items. They were all put out to bid, which is his initial screening of a yes vote.

## ROLL CALL VOTE:

Ayes: DiMaria, Lorenzo, Cusumano, Dean, DeSantis, Haase

Nays:

Absent: Viviano

Motion carried.

11.3D HAAS TM-2P Vertical Machining Center

MOTION by Cusumano, supported by DiMaria that the Board of Trustees authorize the purchase of a HAAS TM-P2 Vertical Machining Center and accessories in the total amount of \$49,730 from Gerotech, Inc. of Flat Rock, MI.

DISCUSSION: Trustee Cusumano said he periodically asks students if everything the College has is state of the art as in their workplace and they invariably indicate yes. He didn't have an opportunity to speak with any students on this equipment. Trustee Cusumano asked if this is the most modern piece of equipment for this particular application. Mr. Tim Pawlowski, Associate Dean for the Applied Tech Area responded that it is and it is replacing a piece of equipment that is 13 year old technology.

## ROLL CALL VOTE:

Ayes: Cusumano, DiMaria, Dean, DeSantis, Lorenzo, Haase

Nays:

Absent: Viviano

Motion carried.

11.3E CISCO Telephony Managed Services

MOTION by DiMaria, supported by Lorenzo that the Board of Trustees authorize Administration to enter into a contract, upon the approval of General Counsel, with Sentinel Technologies of Ann Arbor, MI to provide CISCO Telephony Managed Services for up to three years in an amount not to exceed \$198,000. This amount includes a 5% contingency to cover unexpected or out-of-scope problem resolution assistance.

## ROLL CALL VOTE:

Ayes: DiMaria, Lorenzo, Cusumano, Dean, DeSantis, Haase

Nays:

Absent: Viviano

Motion carried.

11.3F CISCO Phones and Licenses

MOTION by DiMaria, supported by Dean that the Board of Trustees approve the purchase of CISCO desk phones, device licenses and SmartNet software/hardware maintenance and support services in the amount of \$148,010 from CDW-G of Vernon Hills, IL, the lowest bidder meeting college specifications.

ROLL CALL VOTE:

Ayes: DiMaria, Dean, Cusumano, DeSantis, Lorenzo, Haase

Nays:

Absent: Viviano

Motion carried.

12.0 POLICY ACTIONS - none

13.0 ADJOURNMENT

MOTION by DiMaria, supported by Dean, to adjourn the meeting.

Motion carried.

The meeting adjourned at 8:27 p.m.

COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT OF THE COUNTY OF MACOMB BOARD OF TRUSTEES

  
Secretary